

City of Olmsted Falls
Minutes of a Council Work Session
Monday, November 2, 2020, at Olmsted Falls City Hall
26100 Bagley Road – Council Chambers, 6:30 p.m.

Council President Stibich called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m. Roll call was conducted. Councilmen Lori Jones, Jennifer Jansen, Jay McFadden, Cornel Munteanu, Yvonne Buchholz, and Brian Chitester were present.

Discussion Regarding Options for IT Services

Chief Rogers stated that several months ago the finance director, the Mayor and him began discussing replacing our IT support services provider. He stated that they allowed him to be a big part of this discussion because the police department uses 80% to 85% of the IT support services. We have not been pleased with our service from Bailey Communications and all departments also felt that way. Bailey has had almost two complete overhauls of their personnel just this year, someone new would show up who had never been in our building and it has been tough. He stated that he is a big believer in “you get what you pay for” and their relatively inexpensive and this is what happens. He began reaching out to different companies and people. He contacted David Sims who is Strongsville’s IT person and he directed him to Addo Solutions and Nick Artman who is present this evening, and does a lot of work for Strongsville. He stated that he met with Mr. Artman who looked at our servers and systems and basically performed a diagnostic on our system. When Mr. Artman provided his proposal, he stated that whether the city chooses his company or not give this proposal to whomever we choose because these are things that the city needs. He stated that Mr. Artman has been completely honest and wonderful to work with.

Chief Rogers stated that he also spoke with Network Design Consultants and he met with them last Wednesday. They also performed a similar diagnostic of our system. He is supposed to receive their proposal on Wednesday. He has a couple of issues with this company, they have no municipalities as customers nor any law enforcement agencies. He does not want to be the city that they learn from. He also reached out to Kris Oswald who was formally with Bailey Communications but he has a non-compete clause and he and his attorneys feels that he cannot enter into a contract with us until March and another employee until April. He stated that Mr. Oswald wanted the city to perform a RFP but when he did some research each item in the proposal given to Council could be its own RFP, that is how detailed this type of RFP would need to be. He again spoke with Mr. Oswald and indicated that if he cannot submit a proposal, he understands but the city would not be putting out an RFP.

He stated that the fourth company he spoke with was Bailey. He spoke with the individual who comes to the city weekly, and informed him that he needed the passwords for the city servers and he was asked to fill out a work ticket to request them. He informed the representative that the city should already have these passwords as it is our property. He also informed him that the city was looking at other service providers. The representative asked if Bailey could submit a proposal and the Chief informed him that the city has not been happy with Bailey but if they wanted to submit a proposal they could. Chief Rogers indicated that he would not recommend that the city stay with Bailey at this point. Ms. Jansen stated that the city has to submit a letter so many days before the contract renews. Chief Rogers replied that our contract goes through December 31st and we have to

give Bailey 30 days official notice, Mr. Bemer will send a letter which will have to be received by November 30th and is the reason we are having these discussions. He started this process six weeks to two months ago and is glad he did. He stated that as he reviewed this proposal he realized that Council would need to hear this information from a professional not just him standing in front of them saying that our email is old and our servers are old you need to hear it from someone who has been in the systems and knows what he is talking about. He then introduced Mr. Artman.

Mr. Artman stated that his company is a consecutive IT management solution provider. In other words, they do not come in and give the city one microscopic part of a solution, they look at everything from a holistic perspective. This allows us to make sure that all the systems integrate well. With technology these days you have Dropbox, Netflix, windows computer and all these different systems, we look at everything from a high level and how it all fits together to present a good solution to the city. He looked at the different IT systems that the city has in place and performed an analysis, the city has a lot of systems that are old. To generalize into a simple perspective, it looks as if the system was designed and really well thought through 20 years ago and whoever did build the system knew what they were doing. The problem is that it was not maintained very well and quite frankly the city is not receiving much for what they are paying for, basically the city pays for someone to come in for a few hours and do “stuff.” The city is not paying for some of the different things that will help protect the city down the road.

Mr. Artman stated that he lives in Brunswick and other members of his team live in Parma so we are local. He used to live in Olmsted Township and knows the area well. He stated that he has three little girls and was once pulled out of a vehicle by emergency people. The sad thing is the computer systems that we are giving emergency response people are abysmal across the board and so he thinks it is super important for him, his kids, and our community that we have systems that work really well and that is why he is doing this, which is not material, but is worth mentioning.

He stated that the first issue listed is perimeter security firewall. The firewall is the city’s first line of defense which makes sure what comes in and out of the network is okay. The problem is the firewall that is in place is very old and not only does that not inspect the “traffic” and make sure it is safe to pass but, in some cases, can leave the city open to more vulnerabilities. Ms. Jones stated that what Mr. Artman is saying is that the city’s firewall has not been upgraded or updated. Mr. Artman replied that is correct. He has no evidence of patches and knows that the firewall currently in place is at the end of life, which means it is no longer supported. Ms. Jones asked if the city’s current IT firm should have told the city that these were at their end of life so we could prepare for an upgrade. Mr. Artman replied that is something his company would absolutely do. Ms. Jones asked if he would keep the patches current as well. Mr. Artman replied yes. He stated that he partners with Palo Alto and they are the best firewall providers out there and he has very competitive rates. This will be the city’s step one.

He stated that the next step will be securing email services. He stated that the city did have a security breach through email. He stated that 85% to 90% of security breaches happen through email and the city’s email system is from Windows 2008. Ms. Jones stated that she believed that was already done. Mr. Artman replied that from his assessment the city is running Windows Server 2008, some servers have been updated, but this specific server is very old. Ms. Jones asked if this was also end of life. Mr. Artman replied yes. This step is urgent, not because it is old, but because the city’s email service is basically wide open and exposed to the internet, not only does someone have to come into the building to hit the email server they can be in India or some other country. He stated that numerous

municipalities are having similar issues. His solution will take all of the city's email and place them in the cloud behind a security platform. Ms. Jones asked if the servers in the Cloud bounce out of United States servers or do, they go around the world. Mr. Artman replied the United States only. One thing to note he will include is Office 365, which gives not only the email suite but also Outlook Word, Excel, Powerpoint and One Note, so although the city will pay monthly when you amortize the cost of individual Office licenses over five years, this is effectively what you would pay but you get email for free. The city will also receive user training which allows the city to train the employees on how to detect phishing and prevent the breach that happened a year ago. Ms. Jones stated that she asked the current company what plan they had in place to prevent another hacking and asked if they ever tested the system to make sure the security controls were working, but she never received an answer. She would like to know if Mr. Artman would perform testing. Mr. Artman stated that he does not complete SOCK audits, but he has recently invested in penetration tools which are used by hackers to break into networks, he has not performed that for the city, but does do this type of testing.

Mr. Artman stated the next section is Antivirus, Monitoring and Office. This section covers the process of putting a management agent on all of the city's computers to make sure that each system has antivirus and monitoring to make sure they are consistently up-to-date and protected. Ms. Jones asked if the computer would update automatically or would someone have to do it. Mr. Artman replied no, he would install a piece of software that will monitor this for him. So, it will effectively be like an IT guy inside your computer. We monitor it in the Cloud to make sure that all the computers are good and would receive an alert if something happens. He stated that he has yet to identify how the city pays for its antivirus software currently, but his understanding is that somewhere the city is paying for it. It does not appear that the city has a license that it owns. Mr. Stibich asked if Microsoft 365 was one license for all the users. Mr. Artman replied it is one license per person. He stated that there is Office 365 business and Office 365 Cloud Email, the difference is one is twice the rate and the more expensive one gives desk top apps, the other one gives you just Cloud apps, which means you can give people email accounts without giving them the full office license that do not need it. For example, a firefighter that does not need to have the full version of Office on their computer, whereas someone like Chief Rogers would. Mr. Stibich asked if the quantity is the number of users. Mr. Artman replied yes. Mr. Stibich stated that there are various pieces of equipment that each user can have this software on. Mr. Artman replied that you can have up to five different computers. We would be licensing by user. Mr. Stibich stated that the cover letter Mr. Artman provided summarizes each of the sections. He noticed that Mr. Artman placed everything in priority lists.

Mr. Artman stated that the next section is updating antiquated servers. He stated that the primary server the city has is located in the finance department's closet and is very old. Ms. Jones stated that she asked what the city's disaster recover plan or our back up and asked if the new server would provide a back up in the Cloud. Mr. Artman replied that he can absolutely back up to the Cloud. He has two components running, one will be the information server and will contain information about people and another server will store information. For example, files, word documents, pictures, videos, etc. The city's current server is Windows 2012 and was retired two years ago and is not receiving any security updates so it is open to vulnerability. This is another one that is important to handle quickly.

Mr. Artman stated that the next section is support, basically he will be giving the city time to help. He stated that he believes this is a copy of what the city receives from Bailey, but we are going to do

it better. He is quoting the same number of hours because we have better equipment and his people are better trained and will be more helpful.

Chief Rogers indicated that Addo also does twice a year systems audit and he does not believe if that has ever been done. Ms. Jones replied that she asked Bailey a lot of questions and they could not produce anything to answer her questions. Mr. Artman stated that depending on what options the city wants to go with and depending on what the city wants his company to do he has options where his people could come in and complete white hat hacking tests. This means that he will send someone into the building to see if he can plug into the network and walk out without anyone noticing. He will run an audit twice a year to see if his company is keeping up with his end of the deal. Ms. Jones asked if he would keep patch logs. Mr. Artman replied yes.

Mr. Artman stated that Chief Rogers hard drive died and the hard drive was replaced but they did not give him back much of files. Chief Rogers replied that they did recover them. Mr. Artman stated that he would recommend replacing the Police Chief and Fire Chief's computers and it is very likely that more will need to be replaced. Ms. Jones stated that at a previous Council meeting she did bring up replacing key personnel laptops in case they have to work from home. These computers could be paid for through the CARES Act monies the city has received. Mr. Chitester asked if there were specific laptops noted. Mr. Artman replied that he does not have one particularly noted, typically he would issue Lenovo X-One Carbon Laptops. Mr. Chitester replied that those are nice computers. He stated that if any other key personnel needed laptops these would be the ones that are purchased. Mr. Artman replied that he typically stays with these. The desk tops that are issued are Lenovo Think Station which are good computers. Mr. Chitester replied that it seems he stays with Lenovo's. Mr. Artman replied yes as they work better. Ms. Jones asked if the personnel were to have to be off-site would there be a VPN login. Mr. Artman replied that he could provide one. He would have to look through different legalities and will be able to provide at least some level of access. Ms. Jones replied that this could help them work remotely but still have access to the server in a secure manner. Mr. Artman replied that would be the Palo Alto and would give the personnel the ability to remote in securely. He stated that Ms. Jones mentioned CARES Act money and he believes that a couple of sections he is recommending that could qualify for those funds. There are a couple of other cities that have been jumping on that band wagon and there are definite things that you can do to make that happen. Mr. Stibich replied that the finance director would be better to discuss this with.

Mr. Artman stated the next section is Standardize Network Systems. The City has three or four vendors of switches. The components that link everything together it is the hub. We use a system called Ubiquiti and is very well known and good hardware. This will give us a standardized place that we can see where everything is. He or a member on his team or whoever manages this in the future is going to appreciate it. Mr. Stibich asked if new wiring would be required. Mr. Artman stated that there will be some small wiring that needs to be completed downstairs.

Mr. Artman stated the next issue is Wireless Lockdown and because this is a public meeting and public record he will not comment regarding the security. The reason this is a lower priority is because you have to be local to complete it. This will make the police station, City Hall, service center and fire department all wireless and will include wiring which is included in the quote. There have been numerous wireless vulnerabilities in the last few years. Ms. Jones stated that she is concerned about the end of life equipment and patches that are not up-to-date. Mr. Stibich indicated that Council needs to solve the problem.

Mr. Artman stated the next section is video surveillance. The city does not have a good surveillance system and will not comment regarding the current one due to security. The system that he will put into place consists of 14 cameras and believes some of this could be covered under COVID money.

Mr. Artman indicated that he did not get a quote together for cabling upgrade because he feels that the other components need to be done first. The downside is that it will be a little slower for certain people but there is always using the wireless option.

Mr. Artman stated that one issue the city is having with Bailey's and other providers is documentation. He will say that if you do not own your documentation then you do not own your technology. If you do not know how your system is configured or own the passwords to run it then you do not actually own it. What he does which is different than most technology providers is that not only do we write documentation, we actually give real time access to whomever you delegate. For example, Chief Rogers who would have real time access to not just some documentation that we put together but the real documentation that we use internally that are writing and updating and keeping up-to-date when we are on premises. So, if at some point you no longer like Addo Solutions then we give you everything and say that you can choose anyone you would like. Ms. Jones asked if a confidential password it kept with an attorney. Mr. Artman replied we can give access to whomever the city chooses.

Mr. Stibich stated that the dollar amount for the video surveillance is not included on the executive summary page. Mr. Artman replied that we only completed priorities seven through ten on the summary page.

Ms. Jansen asked if Mr. Artman looked at the laptops that are currently in the police cruisers. Mr. Artman replied that he did and does have some security concerns about those and is something that he will address further down the road as it is not as pressing. Mr. Stibich stated that it those are not part of the proposal and we are mainly concerned about getting the basic system set up so all the other outside uses can be tied into them in the proper way. Mr. Artman replied that is correct. We will be going through this step by step and making sure that the city has something that works. In addition, he will have techs on site and once things settle down he will begin working on other issues like changing out the cruiser computers. Chief Rogers stated that the MDT's are getting to "end of life" but it is not as high of a priority as some of the other issues. He feels that it is more important to make sure that the firewall, email and infrastructure are secure. He indicated that getting his five-year capital plan together will include cruisers, laptops, tasers, radios, etc. This is the ground work and once the ground work is laid we will build from that. As Mr. Artman alluded to when you look at our systems, they were really good 20 years the problem is we have not done much since then, which is no one's fault. We never had a need to bring in someone like Mr. Artman and ask that he look at the systems because things have been smooth and since the breach everyone is concerned and wants to take a look at our systems. As to Ms. Jones point, this is something that Bailey absolutely should have told the city years ago. Ms. Jones stated that if we have to have a letter to Bailey by November 30th, she believes that since they let things go past end of life, which she knows how serious, she believes Mr. Bemer should work on that letter now. Chief Rogers replied that he will speak with Mr. Bemer. He stated that when Mr. Artman talks about doing the "white hat" testing we have never had that type of conversation with our IT support services. He stated that he is excited about the proposal and moving our systems into the 21st century.

Ms. Jones stated that the five-year capital plan that Chief Rogers mentioned regarding replacing cruisers; if we could use any of the COVID money for that let's get it all now why wait five years when we have this money now. Chief Rogers stated that cruisers would be in year one or two. To be honest, we are used to tightening our belts and doing one thing at a time but he could certainly take a look. Ms. Jones stated that it would look better when we get our COVID audit if we spent it on something other than salaries and would look better on the "smell test." Mr. Stibich stated that would be a question for Mr. Vitalone. Ms. Jones responded that she watched the videos and asked the questions. Mr. Stibich replied that if Mr. Vitalone already has \$500,000 in personnel expenses that he can justify for it, he doesn't know, but this is a discussion for another meeting. Ms. Jones replied Mr. Vitalone and her talked about it and the smell test and he agrees that we should probably give it to others to make it look better. Mr. Stibich replied that Council would talk to Mr. Vitalone. Ms. Jones replied that she spoke to the State Auditor. Mr. Stibich stated that Council has budget meetings coming up and we will be talking about that. Ms. Jones replied that the city has to have our COVID money targeted by November 20th so we don't have a lot of time.

Mr. Stibich stated that the video surveillance is an "add on" and not something that the city would have to do immediately and asked if the current equipment would be compatible with the proposed new system. Mr. Artman replied yes from a needs perspective this can be added at another time. Chief Rogers indicated that he would not be comfortable discussing the buildings security system or the holes in the system in an open session. Mr. Chitester asked if this was the video feed that goes into the dispatch center. Chief Rogers replied no.

Mr. Chitester asked how much of the proposal is geared towards updating the police department. Mr. Artman replied that he does not have the specific numbers off hand. Mr. Chitester asked for a ballpark. Mr. Artman replied that he would guess at ½ of the cost would be associated to the police department and depends on the number of personnel. Chief Rogers stated that as he previously stated somewhere between 80% and 85% of the city's IT support services is being used by the police department due to the criminal justice systems that we have, LEADS, Watchguard, there is a lot of technology in policing now. In the service department each of their seasonal employees or part time do not have email services, but each officer has to have their own email because that is the way we communicate now. When an officer gives out his or her business card to a victim their individual email address is listed. Just the nature of what his department does requires more IT support services.

Mr. Chitester asked if Mr. Artman had any plans in place if there is another ransomware attack. Mr. Artman replied yes. Mr. Chitester asked if he keeps those up-to-date. Mr. Artman replied that each situation is different and he would have to have a plan for the city which is something that he would develop specifically for the city. Ms. Jones replied that basically if there is a ransomware all you have to do is stop it and call Addo. What she has done in the financial institutions is restore the system from the day before and then move on. Mr. Artman replied assuming that you have someone that is backing it up. Ms. Jones stated that if your patches are not current and you have gone beyond end of life you have no securities or prevention from anything. She used to complete IT audits. As long as the system is backed up regularly you will not have a big deal.

Mr. Stibich asked how long Addo has been in business. Mr. Artman replied legally about a decade. Mr. Stibich asked if he was a national organization. Mr. Artman replied no, he is very local.

Mr. Munteanu asked if Mr. Artman visited the fire station. Mr. Artman replied yes. Mr. Munteanu asked if he saw their needs. Mr. Artman replied yes. They will fall under the same needs as the city.

Mr. Stibich asked how many employees Addo has. Mr. Artman replied that he is currently the only full-time employee. He does have several contractors that he works with in various levels of expertise. He has another person who comes in to handle basic requests and additional people who are experts in various fields. Mr. Stibich replied that he has contractors that act as techs for certain specialties. Mr. Artman replied that generally you have one or two “faces,” he will be a face along with a gentleman named Robert and then people behind the scenes to handle situations that arise. Mr. Stibich asked how many customers Addo has. Mr. Artman replied in the neighborhood of dozens. He is not a huge company and has no interest in being a huge company. Mr. Stibich asked how quickly the summary plan could be implemented. The plan includes a lot of equipment, wiring and devices that have to be set up. If the city terminates Bailey on December 31st can this plan be implemented before December 31st so on January 1st the city is up and running. Mr. Artman replied to catch what Bailey is doing can be done quickly. Completing some things like wireless installation will take a little more time and to be fully honest there are a number of different cities in the area that are looking to do the same thing so there is a demand.

Mr. Stibich stated that the recording system in Chambers, our clerk use to be able to access the system from her PC remotely to start it recording and asked if this equipment would be compatible with the hardware being proposed. Mr. Artman replied he is confident that he can make it work. He would also note that if at any point Council is interested in updating the recording system it would probably qualify for COVID money. There are a lot of things going on and if you have things you are looking to do now is the time. Mr. Stibich stated again, he does not know where Mr. Vitalone stands. Ms. Jansen replied that all of his reports have been fantastic and it doesn't seem like that to anyone else but the reports show we are better than what we thought and there are no financial issues. Mr. Stibich stated that the question here is not are we solvent or have a surplus but does it qualify for COVID, if he has enough in salary and benefits and other things like supplies that have been purchased and feels it is a question for Mr. Vitalone. Ms. Jones replied it does qualify. The auditor told her that when they do the COVID audits they don't want to see it go all to just salaries you want it to have it go to other things to. You don't have to use a lot. Mr. Stibich stated that he does not want this meeting to turn into a CARES Act discussion. Ms. Jansen stated that Council should have another meeting. Mr. Stibich replied maybe at the next Council meeting. Ms. Jansen stated that time is of the essence.

Mr. Munteanu asked if the city would be listening to another proposal. Chief Rogers stated that he is supposed to get another proposal on Wednesday. He wants Council to keep in mind the company submitting that proposal has no municipalities or any police departments that they work for; he believes that is what they want to get into but he does not want to be the guinea pig. Ms. Jones replied that she does not want to be their guinea pig either and when we put it out we should of said only companies experienced in police. Chief Rogers replied that quite frankly he will compare their proposal with Addo Solutions and will provide to Council. Ms. Jones asked since the proposal will be received on Wednesday can Council meet on Thursday as we have to have it ready by next week's Council meeting. Mr. Stibich replied that he does not want to schedule a meeting until we see what the Chief comes up with on the proposal. Chief Rogers replied that he would be happy to send it to Council and then Council can decide.

Ms. Jansen asked if Mr. Stibich was okay with us speaking individually to our finance director or meeting with him. Mr. Stibich replied she can contact the finance director at any time. Ms. Jansen stated that she means in regards to the specific use of COVID funds and if anyone else wanted to be a part of the conversation. Ms. Jones replied yes, then you would hear firsthand that its allowable. She

stated that anyone can go on the state auditor's website as they have all their classes available for free right now and they have the one on the COVID audit. She stated that everyone will get the single line audit on COVID spending. She spoke with Denise from the auditor's office and she was telling her that we do not want to lump it all into salaries because then it looks like you are just doing a shortfall in city's revenues.

Adjournment

Mr. Munteanu moved to **adjourn**; Ms. Jones **seconded**. Voice Vote: 7 ayes; 0 nays. **Motion carried**.

The meeting adjourned at 7:28 p.m.

Paul Stibich, Council President

Angela Mancini, Clerk of Council